



**BOARD OF EQUALIZATION**

**BUSINESS TAXES COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES**

HONORABLE BETTY T. YEE, COMMITTEE CHAIR

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO

MEETING DATE: JUNE 26, 2012, TIME: 10:00 A.M.

---

**ACTION ITEMS & STATUS REPORT ITEMS**

**Agenda Item No: 1**

**Title: Proposed Regulation 4801 and amendments to Regulations 4601, 4603, 4604, and 4605 under the Cigarette and Tobacco Products Licensing Act (Act).**

**Action 1**

**Proposed Amendments to Regulation 4601, *Service of a Notice of Violation or Warning.***

**Issue:**

Request approval and authorization to publish proposed amendments to Regulation 4601 to clarify the service requirements for notices issued under the Act.

**Committee Discussion:**

There was no discussion of this item.

**Committee Action:**

Upon motion by Mr. Horton and seconded by Mr. Runner, without objection, the Committee approved the proposed regulatory amendments.

There is no operative date, and implementation will take place 30 days after approval by the Office of Administrative Law. A copy of the proposed amendments to Regulation 4601 is attached.

**Action 2**

**Proposed Regulation 4801, *Transfers of Cigarettes and Tobacco Products between Retail Stores Owned by the Same Person.***

**Issue:**

Request approval and authorization to publish proposed Regulation 4801 formalizing the current policy on transfers of cigarettes and tobacco products between retail stores owned by the same person.

**Committee Discussion:**

Staff introduced the topic for discussion. Mr. Steven Alari, representing SEIU Local 1000, stated his objection to staff's proposal and recommended that the Board adopt a regulation preventing the transfer of cigarettes and tobacco products. While some Board Members expressed support for the proposed regulation, there were also concerns raised that the regulation may not be clear in what constitutes "same legal entity." In addition, concerns were raised regarding adequate inventory controls when transferring products. Ms. Mandel also asked that staff include in the sample transfer log all the required elements to satisfy the inspectors.

**Committee Action:**

The Board directed staff to work with Investigation Division to further address these concerns, and bring the issue back to the Board in an expedited manner.

**Action 3**

***Proposed Amendments to Regulations 4603, Penalties for Licensed or Unlicensed Retailers; 4604, Penalties for Licensed or Unlicensed Wholesalers and Distributors, and 4605; Penalties for Licensed or Unlicensed Manufacturers and Importers.***

**Issue:**

Request approval and authorization to publish proposed amendments to Regulations 4603, 4604 and 4605, providing staff with additional flexibility in setting a period of suspension.

**Committee Discussion:**

Staff introduced the topic for discussion. Mr. Steven Alari, representing SEIU Local 1000, generally supported staff's recommendation and was opposed to the alternative that could have resulted in a suspension period less than 5 days. Ms. Steel expressed concern that a 5-day alternative would be imposed in lieu of a 0-day suspension. Staff noted that although in some cases this may be correct, in other cases what may have been a 10-day suspension may result in a 5-day suspension period. The Board Members raised concerns that the start date of the suspension period is always on a Friday and recommended that an alternative day be utilized, such as Monday to start the period of suspension.

**Committee Action:**

Upon motion by Mr. Runner, seconded by Mr. Horton, without objection, the Committee approved the proposed regulatory amendments, and directed staff to implement an alternative start day for suspension periods. A copy of the proposed amendments to Regulations 4603, 4604 and 4605 is attached.

/s/ Betty T. Yee

---

Honorable Betty T. Yee, Committee Chair

/s/ Kristine Cazadd

---

Kristine Cazadd, Executive Director

**BOARD APPROVED**

at the June 27, 2012 Board Meeting

/s/ Joann Richmond

---

Joann Richmond, Chief  
Board Proceedings Division

**Regulation 4601. Service of a Notice of Violation or Warning Notice**

Any notice issued under the Cigarette and Tobacco Products Licensing Act may be served personally or by mail in the manner prescribed for service of a notice of determination under Revenue and Taxation Code section 30206 of the Cigarette and Tobacco Products Tax Law. The Notice of Suspension, Notice of Revocation, Notice of Violation or Warning Notice shall be placed in a sealed envelope, with postage paid, addressed to the licensee or unlicensed person at his or her last known address as it appears in the records of the Board. The giving of notice shall be deemed complete at the time of deposit of the notice at a United States Post Office, a mailbox, sub post office, substation, mail chute, or other facility regularly maintained or provided by the United States Postal Service, without extension of time for any reason. In lieu of mailing, a Notice of Violation may be served personally by delivery to the person to be served and service shall be deemed complete at the time of such delivery. Personal delivery to a corporation may be made by delivery of a notice to any person designated to be served for the corporation with summons and complaint in a civil action, pursuant to the Code of Civil Procedure.

**Regulation 4603. Penalties for Licensed or Unlicensed Retailers**

The following penalties shall be assessed in addition to any other civil or criminal penalty provided by law upon a finding that a retailer has violated any provision of the Act:

**(a)** A first offense of a violation of any of the following provisions shall result in the issuance of a Warning Notice to the licensee or unlicensed person:

(1) Business and Professions Code section 22974 (retailer's failure to retain purchase invoices).

(2) Business and Professions Code section 22980.1, subdivision (c), (d) or (e) (purchase from unlicensed person or person with suspended or revoked license).

(3) Business and Professions Code section 22980.1, subdivision (g) (purchase of cigarettes to which a stamp may not be affixed in accordance with Rev. & Tax. Code, § 30163, subdivision (b)).

(4) Business and Professions Code section 22980.2, subdivision (a) (sales of cigarettes or tobacco products by an unlicensed person or person with suspended or revoked license).

**(b)** A first offense of a violation of any of the following provisions shall result in the issuance of a 20-day suspension:

(1) Business and Professions Code section 22973, subdivision (a)(5) (retailer's false statement on application).

(2) Business and Professions Code section 22980, subdivision (b) (any person's refusal to allow inspection).

**(c)** A second or subsequent offense for a violation of the provisions listed in subdivision (a) or (b) above, shall result in both a 30-day suspension or revocation and a fine. The fine shall be determined in accordance with Regulation 4607.

**(d)** A violation of Business and Profession Code section 22974.3 (possession of unstamped cigarettes or untaxed tobacco products) shall result in the following:

(1) Notwithstanding paragraphs (2) and (3) below, a Warning Notice for a first offense when the licensee has been in business for less than one month and there has been no purchase of new cigarette or tobacco product inventory during that period.

(2) A 10-day suspension for a first offense for a seizure of less than 20 packages of cigarettes, or the equivalent amount of tobacco products based on wholesale cost.

(3) A 20-day suspension for a first offense for a seizure of 20 packages of cigarettes or more, or the equivalent amount of tobacco products based on wholesale cost.

(4) Both a 30-day suspension or revocation and a fine for a second or subsequent offense. The fine shall be determined in accordance with Regulation 4607.

**(e)** In cases involving multiple violations, the violation punishable by the most severe penalty will be used for purposes of determining the penalty assessed.

**(f)** Notwithstanding subdivisions (b) through (e) above, a reduction in the length of a suspension period may be warranted if mitigating circumstances are present, as set forth in Regulation 4606. If any suspension period is reduced, the redetermined period of suspension shall be 0 days, 5 days, 10 days, or 20 days. The existence of mitigating circumstances may also warrant reducing a revocation penalty to a 30-day suspension, unless revocation is mandated pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 22974.3 subdivision (a)(2) or subdivision (a)(4), 22974.4, ~~22978.6~~, or 22980.3, subdivision (a)(2) or subdivision (d).

**Regulation 4604. Penalties for Licensed or Unlicensed Wholesalers and Distributors**

The following penalties shall be assessed in addition to any other civil or criminal penalty provided by law upon a finding that a wholesaler or distributor has violated any provision of the Act:

**(a)** A first offense of a violation of any of the following provisions will result in the issuance of a Warning Notice to the licensee or unlicensed person:

(1) Business and Professions Code section 22978.1 (distributor's or wholesaler's failure to retain purchase invoices).

(2) Business and Professions Code section 22978.4, subdivision (c) (distributor's or wholesaler's failure to comply with invoice requirements).

(3) Business and Professions Code section 22978.5, subdivision (b) (distributor's or wholesaler's failure to retain sales records).

(4) Business and Professions Code section 22980.1, subdivision (b), (c), (d), (e) (sales to or purchases from unlicensed person or person with suspended or revoked license) or (f) (sales of cigarettes or tobacco products to retailer or wholesaler revoked or suspended until debts are clear).

(5) Business and Professions Code section 22980.2, subdivision (a) (sales of cigarettes or tobacco products by unlicensed person or person with suspended or revoked license).

**(b)** A first offense of a violation of any of the following provisions will result in the issuance of a 20-day suspension:

(1) Business and Professions Code section 22977, subdivision (a)(5) (distributor's or wholesaler's false statement on application).

(2) Business and Professions Code section 22980, subdivision (b) (any person's refusal to allow inspection).

(3) Business and Professions Code section 22980.1, subdivision (g) (purchase of cigarettes to which a stamp may not be affixed in accordance with Rev. & Tax. Code, § 30163, subdivision. (b)).

**(c)** A second or subsequent offense for a violation of the provisions listed in subdivision (a) or (b) above shall result in both a 30-day suspension or revocation, and a fine. The fine shall be determined in accordance with Regulation 4607.

**(d)** A violation of Business and Profession Code section 22978.2 (possession of counterfeit stamped cigarettes by distributors, unstamped cigarettes by wholesalers or untaxed tobacco products) shall result in the following:

(1) Notwithstanding paragraphs (2) and (3) below, a Warning Notice for a first offense when the licensee or unlicensed person has been in business for less than one month and there has been no purchase of new cigarette or tobacco product inventory during the month.

(2) A 10-day suspension for a first offense for a seizure of less than 20 packages of cigarettes, or the equivalent amount of tobacco products based on wholesale cost.

(3) A 20-day suspension for a first offense for a seizure of 20 packages of cigarettes or more, or the equivalent amount of tobacco products based on wholesale cost.

(4) Both a 30-day suspension or revocation and a fine for a second or subsequent offense. The fine will be determined in accordance with section 4607.

**(e)** In cases involving multiple violations, the violation punishable by the most severe penalty will be used for purposes of determining the penalty assessed.

Regulation 4604. Penalties for Licensed or Unlicensed Wholesalers and Distributors (Cont.)

(f) Notwithstanding subdivisions (b) through (e) above, a reduction in the length of a suspension period may be warranted if mitigating circumstances are present, as set forth in Regulation 4606. If any suspension period is reduced, the redetermined period of suspension shall be 0 days, 5 days, 10 days, or 20 days. The existence of mitigating circumstances may also warrant reducing a revocation penalty to a 30-day suspension, unless revocation is mandated pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 22974.4, 22978.2, subdivision (a)(2) or subdivision (a)(4), 22978.6, or 22980.3, subdivision (a)(2) or subdivision (d).

**Regulation 4605. Penalties for Licensed or Unlicensed Manufacturers and Importers**

The following penalties shall be assessed in addition to any other civil or criminal penalty provided by law upon a finding that a manufacturer or importer has violated any provision of the Act:

**(a)** A first offense of a violation of any of the following provisions will result in the issuance of a Warning Notice to the licensee or unlicensed person:

(1) Business and Professions Code section 22979.4 (importer's failure to retain purchase invoices on premises).

(2) Business and Professions Code section 22979, subdivision (b)(1) (participating manufacturer's false statement on certification to the Board).

(3) Business and Professions Code section 22979.5, subdivision (b) (manufacturer's or importer's failure to retain sales records on premises).

(4) Business and Professions Code section 22980.1, subdivision (a), (e) or (f) (purchases or sales from or to an unlicensed person or person with suspended or revoked license).

(5) Business and Professions Code section 22980.2, subdivision (a) (sales of cigarettes or tobacco products by unlicensed person or person with suspended or revoked license).

(6) Business and Professions Code section 22979.6, subdivision (c) (manufacturer's or importer's failure to comply with invoice requirements).

**(b)** A first offense of a violation of Business and Professions Code section 22980.1, subdivision (g) (purchase of cigarettes to which a stamp may not be affixed in accordance with Rev. & Tax. Code, § 30163, subdivision. (b)) shall result in a 20-day suspension.

**(c)** A second or subsequent offense for a violation of the provisions listed in subdivision (a) or (b) above shall result in both a 30-day suspension or revocation and a fine.

**(d)** In cases involving multiple violations, the violation punishable by the most severe penalty will be used for purposes of determining the penalty assessed.

**(e)** Notwithstanding subdivisions (b) through (d) above, a reduction in the length of a suspension period may be warranted if mitigating circumstances are present, as set forth in Regulation 4606. If any suspension period is reduced, the redetermined period of suspension shall be 0 days, 5 days, 10 days, or 20 days. The existence of mitigating circumstances may also warrant reducing a revocation penalty to a 30-day suspension, unless revocation is mandated pursuant to Business and Professions Code section ~~22974.4, 22978.6, or 22980.3~~, subdivision (a)(2) or subdivision (d).